



ASSESSMENT SUMMARY v1.0.0

[ETSI TS 119 612¹](#)

European Telecommunication Standards Institute (ETSI)²

¹ETSI TS 119 612 specification: [TS 119 612 - V2.2.1 - Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures \(ESI\); Trusted Lists \(etsi.org\)](#)

² ETSI webpage: [ETSI - Welcome to the World of Standards!](#)

Change Control

Modification	Details
Version 1.0.0	
Initial version	

TABLE OF CONTENT

- 1. INTRODUCTION..... 4**
- 2. ASSESSMENT SUMMARY 4**
 - 2.1. EIF Interoperability Principles.....4
 - 2.2. EIF Interoperability Layers6
- 3. ASSESSMENT RESULTS 8**

1. INTRODUCTION

The present document is a summary of the assessment of the **Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI); Trusted Lists** carried out by CAMSS using the CAMSS Assessment EIF scenario³. The purpose of this scenario is assessing the compliance of a standard or specification with the European Interoperability Framework (EIF)⁴.

2. ASSESSMENT SUMMARY

The **ETSI TS 119 612 provides a common time-stamping protocol and token profiles for a Trusted List Scheme Operator (TLSO) to provide information on the status and history of Trusted Service Provider (TSP) services concerning compliance with relevant legislation.**

The specification has been developed by the European Telecommunication Standards Institute (ETSI) which is a European Standards Development Organization concerned with the development of standards that support European regulations and legislation such as the Electronic Signatures and Infrastructure (ESI) Family of specifications, of which ETSI TS 119 612 takes part.

2.1. EIF Interoperability Principles

Interoperability principles are fundamental behavioural aspects that drive interoperability actions. They are relevant to the process of establishing interoperable European public services. They describe the context in which European public services are designed and implemented.

The specification does not supports the principles setting context for EU actions on interoperability:

- **Subsidiarity and proportionality**

No Member State that includes the ETSI TS 119 612 in their national catalogue with Their National Interoperability Framework (NIF) in alignment with the three categories 1. Conceptual model for integrated public services provision, 2. interoperability layers, and 3. interoperability principles.

The specification partially supports the principles setting context for EU actions on interoperability:

- **Openness**

Sadly ETSI TS 119 612 is not related to the publication of open data, therefore it is not applicable to the specification. The specification has been developed by ETSI, whose IPR policies are royalty-free and it is also licensed under a (F)RAND basis. Moreover, ETSI is the developer community in charge of maintaining the specification.

³ EIF Scenario homepage: https://ec.europa.eu/eusurvey/runner/EIFScenario_v510

⁴EIF website: https://ec.europa.eu/isa2/eif_en

Given the long history of the development of the ESI family of specifications, as well as the central role it plays in the validation and authentication system for electronic signatures in public administrations, ETSI TS 119 612 is considered to be sufficiently mature for the development of digital solutions and services.

- **Transparency**

ETSI TS 119 612 can contribute to a better comprehensibility of administrative procedures as it provides an interface between users and preservation services used by trust service providers. Nevertheless, ETSI TS 119 612 enables the exposure of interfaces by allowing Trusted List Scheme Operators (TLSO) to make Trusted Lists (TL's) available through HTTP.

- **Reusability**

ETSI TS 119 612 can be applied in any domain and context where the use of time-stamping protocol is realized. Therefore, the specification is usable beyond any business-specific domain and can be used in any kind of organisation.

- **Technological neutrality and data portability**

Considering that ETSI TS 119 612 is part of the larger family of Electronic Signatures and Infrastructures (ESI) specifications, it is not technology agnostic, nevertheless, it does not rely on any specific platform and it is only meant to be implemented as a whole and does not allow any kind of customisation. It is worth noting that ETSI TS 119 612 can be considered it supports the evolution of European public services by specifying a format and mechanism to establish, locate, access and authenticate trusted lists which make available trust service status information so interested parties may determine the status of a listed trust service at a given time.

The specification does not support the principles related to generic user needs and expectations:

- **User-centricity**

ETSI TS 119 612 does not indicate that relevant information is allowed to be reused, meaning that all information needs to be provided whenever it is needed.

- **Inclusion and accessibility**

The purpose of ETSI TS 119 612 is not related to e-accessibility. Therefore, this criterion is considered not applicable to this specification.

- **Security and privacy**

EU Member States' trusted lists were established in the EU and aimed primarily at supporting the validation of advanced electronic signatures supported by a qualified certificate and advanced electronic signature supported by both a qualified certificate and by a secure signature creation device, as far as they included as minimum trust service provided supervised/accredited for issuing qualified certificates. This method can explicitly address and enable the secure and trustworthy exchange of data as it is using an advanced electronic signature which is supported by a qualified certificate and a secure signature creation device. Therefore, ETSI TS 119 612 can be considered to directly tackle matters of security and privacy.

- **Multilingualism**

The specification counts with a specific section that is about Language Support, so it can be determined that is designed to fully support multilingualism.

The specification partially supports the foundation principles for cooperation among public administrations:

- **Administrative Simplification**

ETSI TS 119 612 does simplify the delivery of European public services as TLSOs shall define, maintain and implement appropriate measures, practices and policies, including change management and security procedures, for establishing, publishing and maintaining the trusted list to ensure that the information provided in the trusted list is timely, accurate, complete and authentic.

- **Preservation of information**

The objective of ETSI TS 119 612 is not to enable the long-term preservation of data information, moreover it is described that the hyperlinks cannot be guaranteed to have long term validity. Therefore, the specification neither addresses the preservation of information nor prevents it.

- **Assessment of effectiveness and efficiency**

There has not been found anything regarding the specification's effectiveness.

2.2. EIF Interoperability Layers

The interoperability model which is applicable to all digital public services includes:

- Four layers of interoperability: legal, organisational, semantic and technical;
- A cross-cutting component of the four layers, 'integrated public service governance';
- A background layer, 'interoperability governance'.

The Specification supports the implementation of digital public services complying with the EIF interoperability model:

- **Interoperability governance**

ETSI TS 119 612 is already associated with EIRA ABBs in the EIRA Library Of Interoperability Specifications (ELIS). More specifically, ETSI TS 119 612 can define the "e-Signature Creation Service" and the "e-Signature Verification and Validation Service" ABB of the EIRA Technical view. . In terms of implementation conformity, there is no available validation tool provided by ETSI or any other platform or developer.

- **Legal Interoperability**

ETSI TS 119 612 has been developed by the European Telecommunication Standards Institute (ETSI), an independent, not-for-profit, standardization organization in the field of information and communications. Moreover, it has been also mentioned to be an important component in

Regulation (EU) No 910/2014 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 23 July 2014 on electronic identification and trust services for electronic transactions in the internal market⁵.

- **Organisational interoperability**

ETSI TS 119 612 can facilitate the modelling of business processes when it comes to defining the relationships among the preservation schemes, preservation profiles and their related policies on a given business-specific trust service. Being a component derived from the actions implemented based on regulation No 910/2014, ETSI TS 119 612 is also an enabler of organisational interoperability agreements.

- **Semantic Interoperability**

ETSI TS 119 612 specification is distributed from the ETSI platform. ETSI supports European regulations and legislation through the creation of Harmonised European Standards. ETSI's mission is to provide platforms where interested parties come together and collaborate on the development and promotion of standards for Information and Communication Technology (ICT) systems and services.

⁵ Regulation (EU) No 910/2014 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 23 July 2014 on electronic identification and trust services for electronic transactions in the internal market: [EUR-Lex - 32014R0910 - EN - EUR-Lex \(europa.eu\)](#)

3. ASSESSMENT RESULTS

This section presents an overview of the results of the CAMSS assessments for **ETSI TS 119 612**. The CAMSS “Strength” indicator measures the reliability of the assessment by calculating the number of answered (applicable) criteria. On the other hand, the number of favourable answers and the number of unfavourable ones are used to calculate the “Automated Score” per category and an “Overall Score”.

Category	Automated Score	Assessment Strength	Compliance Level
Principle setting the context for EU actions on interoperability	20/100 (20%)	100%	Ad-hoc
Core interoperability principles	1680/2100 (80%)	95%	Sustainable
Principles related to generic user needs and expectations	420/500 (84%)	80%	Seamless
Foundation principles for cooperation among public administrations	280/500 (56%)	100%	Essential
Interoperability layers*	900/1100 (82%)	100%	Seamless
Overall Score	3000/4000 (75%) ⁶	95%	

**The technical interoperability layer is covered by the criteria corresponding to the core interoperability principle "Openness".*

With a 95% of assessment strength, this assessment can be considered representative of the specification compliance with the EIF principles and recommendations.

The Overall Automated Score of 75% (3000/4000) demonstrates that the specification supports the European Interoperability Framework in the domains where it applies.

⁶ See the “results interpretation” section of the CAMSS Assessment EIF Scenario Quick User Guide:

<https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/collection/common-assessment-method-standards-and-specifications-camss/solution/camss-assessment-eif-scenario/results-visualisation-and-interpretation>