**2015-04-17**

**Revision of DCAT-AP**

**Working Group Meeting 2**

Meeting Minutes

|  |
| --- |
| Revision of DCAT-AP | Working Group Meeting 2 |
| Venue | Web meeting | Meeting date | 2015-04-20 |
| Author | Brecht WynsStefanos Kotoglou | Meeting time | 13:30 – 15:00 |
| Reviewed by | Nikolaos LoutasMakx Dekkers | Issue date | 2015-04-20 |
| Status | for review | Version | 0.02 |

# Attendees

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Name | Abbreviation | Organisation |
| Vassilios Peristeras | VP | ISA Programme,European Commission |
| Valentina Fratto | VF | Publications Office,European Commission |
| Norbert Hohn (**Chair**) | NH | Publications Office, European Commission |
| Willem Van Gemert | WVG | Publications Office, European Commission |
| Agnieszka Zajac | AZ | Publications Office, European Commisison |
| Martin Alvarez | MA | W3C |
| Øystein Åsnes | ØÅ | Agency for Public Management and eGovernment (Difi) |
| Jean Delahousse | JD | Consultant at the Publications Office, European Commission |
| Anastasia Dimou | AD | Ghent University, iMinds |
| Benjamin Dittwald | BD | Fraunhofer |
| Simon Dutkowski | SD | Fraunhofer |
| Mario Fendler | MF | Intrasoft |
| Bart Hanssens | BH | Fedict, Belgian Government |
| Carlos Iglesias | CI | Independent Open Data Consultant |
| Hans Overbeek | HO | National Data Portal, Netherlands |
| David Read | DR | Skidmore College |
| Bert van Nuffelen | BV | Tenforce |
| Makx Dekkers (**Editor**) | MD | AMI Consult |
| Nikolaos Loutas | NL | PwC EU Services |
| Brecht Wyns | BW | PwC EU Services |

# Agenda

The agenda of the second working group meeting included the following topics:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Time | Topic | Speaker |
| 13:30 | Opening, roll call | Norbert Hohn |
| 13:40 | Status update | Makx Dekkers |
| 13:45 | Issues 1.1 and 2.1 through 2.5Following the overview of issues & proposed solutions[[1]](#footnote-1) | Makx Dekkers |
| 14:45 | Other comments from the Working Group on other issues | Norbert Hohn |
| 14:55 | Next steps, next meeting | Norbert Hohn |

# Discussion on the issues & proposed solutions

*(Numbering is in line with the* [*resolution proposal*](https://webgate.ec.europa.eu/CITnet/confluence/download/attachments/384106873/DCAT-AP%20resolution%20proposals%20v0.01.docx?version=1&modificationDate=1428854022109&api=v2) *doc)*

# Discussion items without proposed resolution

## Theme vocabulary

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Joinup issues:  | [VO2](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/vo2-create-new-list-concepts-property-theme) |
| Description:  | Publications Office has proposed a [new list](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/sites/default/files/review_dcat_ap_-_draft_proposal_of_the_list_of_topics_for_categorizing_data_-v2-including_inspire.xls). Little discussion has taken place, and no clear consensus has been reached yet. |
| Proposed resolution: | None. |
| Proposed action: | To be discussed. |

AZ urges members of the working group, especially representatives of national data portals to share feedback on this issue on the proposed list of themes.

*Chatbox*:
**David Read**: List of 13 is in the comment on this page: <https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/node/139531>

# Discussion items with proposed resolution

## Provenance

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Joinup issues:  | [PR6](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/pr6-add-new-property-dataset-refer-authority-responsible-making), [PR13](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/pr13-add-new-property-dataset-refer-other-datasets-were-used-in), [PR14](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/pr14-add-new-property-express-lineage), [MO5](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/mo5-add-class-originalmetadatarecord-and-specify-property-refer) |
| Description:  | Various proposals to add provenance and lineage information. There is one set of proposals to identify some provenance aspects with the use of specific properties, and one proposal to include some of the PROV ontology to express more formally provenance aspects.The potential properties proposed would identify:* the responsible authority of the Dataset, e.g. dct:creator on Dataset
* the lineage of a Dataset, e.g. dct:provenance on Dataset
* the Dataset that was used as input, e.g. dct:source on Dataset
* the original metadata, e.g. dct:source on CatalogRecord

The inclusion of parts of PROV would need a separate discussion. |
| Proposed resolution: | For the time being, agree on the approach with the four additional properties. Create new work item to consider inclusion of parts of PROV for future work. |
| Proposed action: | Add dct:provenance and dct:source as optional properties on Dataset. The other two are already in draft 1. |

No comments were raised regarding the proposed solution. Potential overlaps with the work on GeoDCAT-AP should be taken into account.

## Distribution details

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Joinup issues:  | [details-distribution](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/details-distribution), [MO1](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/mo1-design-approach-include-reference-schema-dataset/distributi), [IM2](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/im2-how-describe-datasets-available-services-specific-access-me), [IM8](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/im8-clarify-use-format-describe-data-distribution) |
| Description:  | Current proposal suggests to use dct:conformsTo to link to a schema, and to use dct:description to provide human-readable information, e.g. about an API or SPARQL endpoint |
| Proposed resolution: | Adopt approach with the two properties. |
| Proposed action: | Add dct:conformsTo as optional property on Distribution. dct:description is already in DCAT-AP 1.01 as a recommended property on Distribution. |

David Read proposed to agree on a common string for describing distribution details, e.g. the word “SPARQL” could be in the description of the Distribution. The discussion will be further continued via Joinup.

## Media type and format

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Joinup issues:  | [PR22](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/pr22-remove-dcatmediatype-and-only-use-dctformat), [VO3](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/vo3-propose-uri-set-be-used-property-format) |
| Description:  | The specification of the same controlled vocabulary for both dcat:mediaType and dct:format is confusing. Suggestions made include the use of the Publications Office’ MDR File Type NAL which includes all IANA types plus some others, and to re-interpret DCATs written "IANA mediatypes" rather as "following the RFC 2046/RFC 4288 specification" which would include also the x- tree. |
| Proposed resolution: | Use the MDR File Type NAL for dct:format and also use dcat:mediaType if and only if the filetype has been registered in IANA. This is compliant with the [usage note](http://www.w3.org/TR/vocab-dcat/#Property:distribution_media_type) in DCAT. |
| Proposed action: | Change controlled vocabulary for dcat:mediaType to the types registered by IANA. Keep MDR File types NAL for dct:format. |

No objections to the proposal were raised, though it was stressed that the IANA list does not make use of dereferenceable URIs. An option is to use the URLs instead of URIs to identify resources.

## Places

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Joinup issues:  | [VO9](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/vo9-add-necessary-place-mdr-places-nal-and/or-identify-and-reco) |
| Description:  | Issue has been raised that not all places necessary are in the MDR Places NAL. DCAT-AP now mandates the use of the Countries NAL and the Places NAL. |
| Proposed resolution: | Give recommendation for additional vocabulary in case the location is not in the Places NAL, e.g. Geonames |
| Proposed action: | Add recommendation to use URIs from <http://sws.geonames.org/> if place not in Places NAL. |

No objections were raised.

## Frequency vocabulary

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Joinup issues:  | [VO4](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/vo4-choose-between-dcmi-and-sdmx-frequency-vocabulary) |
| Description:  | DCAT-AP mandates the use of the DCMI Frequency vocabulary, while DCAT uses a code list from SDMX in an example. |
| Proposed resolution: | As the DCMI set has more terms than the SDMX list, and changing the vocabulary will require implementations to convert data, there should be no change unless there are compelling arguments to do so. |
| Proposed action: | None. |

The Working Group proposes to open the discussion on which vocabularies could be used.

# Fix by adding one or more properties

## Whole/part relationships

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Joinup issues:  | [PR11](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/pr11-add-new-properties-dataset-express-haspart-and-ispartof-re), [MO12](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/mo12-grouping-datasets), [nesting-part-relationships-catalog-and-dataset](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/nesting-part-relationships-catalog-and-dataset) |
| Description:  | A need was expressed to link between a ‘father’ dataset and its children. |
| Proposed resolution: | Provide hasPart and isPartOf relationships between Datasets. |
| Proposed action: | Add dct:hasPart and dct:isPartOf as optional properties on Dataset. |

The Working Group supports the proposal.

*Chatbox:*

*Andrea Perego (JRC): +1 to proposal 3.3*

*Publications Office: +1*

*Hans Overbeek (NL): no objection*

# Won’t fix

## Type of dataset

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Joinup issues:  | [PR27](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/pr27-indicate-type-data-dataset) |
| Description:  | Current proposals appear to be on a general level. There does not seem to be a consensus on what kinds of types would need to be distinguished and it is not clear what controlled vocabulary could be used. |
| Proposed resolution: | No change. |
| Proposed action: | None. |

The Publications Office proposes to consider fixing this issue, although it was initially listed as “won’t fix”. A controlled vocabulary would however be needed. As the Publications Office might develop such a vocabulary in the future, it would be useful to foresee a property in DCAT-AP.

*Chatbox:*

*Andrea Perego (JRC): About proposal 6.1: no objection to have this property (dct:type) as optional
Voiceover AP:* VOID vocabulary might provide help.

## Metadata licence

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Joinup issues:  | [how-express-metadata-license](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/how-express-metadata-license)  |
| Description:  | Request was formulated tentatively but no strong case was made. |
| Proposed resolution: | No change. |
| Proposed action: | None. |

The Working Group proposes to consider fixing this issue, although it was initially listed as “won’t fix”. Could be described using dct:licence on the catalogRecord.

*Chatbox:*

*Bert Van Nuffelen 2: I just wanted to add for the type that this is a valueable property in order to identify the variants of DCAT-AP*

*Andrea Perego (JRC): @Bert, maybe this can also be addressed by using dct:conformsTo for the metadata record (dcat:Catalog)*

## Translated text

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Joinup issues:  | [MO6](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/mo6-add-new-class-translatedtext-properties-language-method-and) |
| Description:  | Request was made to enable expression of additional attributes on literals to indicate whether a translation was done by a person or a machine, and what the quality of the translation is. |
| Proposed resolution: | A resolution would require the class rdfs:Literal to be redefined which is not what the requested intended.. |
| Proposed action: | None. |

The Working Group proposes to consider fixing this issue, although it was initially listed as “won’t fix”. A proposal will be made on Joinup to facilitate the discussion.

## Nesting of catalogues

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Joinup issues:  | [nesting-part-relationships-catalog-and-dataset](https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/asset/dcat_application_profile/issue/nesting-part-relationships-catalog-and-dataset)  |
| Description:  | Question whether there is a need to have part of relationships between catalogues. There has been no discussion or support for this need. |
| Proposed resolution: | No change. |
| Proposed action: | None. |

A proposal will be made on Joinup to facilitate the discussion and to investigate whether there is strong support for fixing this issue.

# Summary of the main open points

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Issue | Open points |
| Modelling issues | * How to handle translations.
* How to apply hasPart and hasVersion relations.
* Need for expression of nested catalogues.
 |
| Vocabulary/ Value issues | * Opinions on the new, 13-term theme vocabulary proposed by the Publications office.
* Opinions on the frequency vocabulary proposed by the Publications office.
* Suggestions for the terms of a dataset type vocabulary to be hosted by the Publications office.
* How to refer to IANA file type.
* Agreement on standard text for SPARQL endpoint.
 |

# Next steps

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Action  | Owner | Date |
| Schedule 3rd working group meeting (week of 11/05) | PwC | 24/04/2015 |
| Share draft 3 of the revised DCAT-AP | MDPwC | Week of03/05/2015 |

**Chatbox**

*Brecht Wyns (PwC): Hi all, welcome to the DCAT-AP working group meeting*

*Brecht Wyns (PwC): Can I please remind you to mute your phones when you are not speaking, so we avoid having noise and echos on the line*

*Anastasia Dimou: I'm here!*

*Vassilios Peristeras EC/ISA: I am here too*

*Hans Overbeek (NL): I'm here*

*David Read: List of 13 is in the comment on this page: https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/node/139531*

*Andrea Perego (JRC): +1 to the proposal concerning dct:conformsTo*

*Andrea Perego (JRC): +1 to proposal 2.3*

*Nikos Loutas, PwC: @Andrea, spot on! I was thinking the same...especially for IANA, (e.g.* [*https://www.iana.org/assignments/media-types/application/rdf+xml*](https://www.iana.org/assignments/media-types/application/rdf%2Bxml)*?) shall we use the URLs instead of URIs?*

*Andrea Perego (JRC): Yes, Nikos, this might be an option.*

*Nikos Loutas, PwC: @all we have a participant with name "-", can you please type here your name and affiliation?*

*Hans Overbeek (NL): sorry, what is the piublication office list?*

*Bert Van Nuffelen 2: it might be my phone connection: I lost connection, but my audio stayed oconnected*

*Publications Office: @ Hans: https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/node/139531*

*Andrea Perego (JRC): For the file types: http://publications.europa.eu/mdr/authority/file-type/*

*Bart Hanssens (Fedict): +1 for geonames*

*Hans Overbeek (NL): I see: MDR lists. Thnx!*

*Andrea Perego (JRC): About proposal 6.1: no objection to have this property (dct:type) as optional*

*Bert Van Nuffelen 2: I just wanted to add for the type that this is a valueable property in order to identify the variants of DCAT-AP*

*Andrea Perego (JRC): @Bert, maybe this can also be addressed by using dct:conformsTo for the metadata record (dcat:Catalog)*

*Andrea Perego (JRC): Can I make a question on 64.?*

*Bert Van Nuffelen 2: @Andrea: indeed that is another option, and probably even makes more sence*

*Andrea Perego (JRC): Thanks for the clarification on 6.4!*

*Andrea Perego (JRC): +1 to using dct:hasPart / dct:isPartOf for 6.5*

*Andrea Perego (JRC): +1 to proposal 3.3*

*Publications Office: +1*

*Hans Overbeek (NL): no objection*

*Bert Van Nuffelen 2: on 3.4: why limited to temporal dimension? why not spatial and other dimensions.*

*Bert Van Nuffelen 2: on 3.4: I propose to describe the usage with good examples.*

*Andrea Perego (JRC): +1 to Bert's proposal. There's an overlap with 3.3 which may make unclear when to use dct:hasPart and when dct:hasVersion.*

*Nikos Loutas, PwC: +1 @Bert and also see how this relates to the StatDCAT-AP activity that we are about to start*

*Andrea Perego (JRC): Bye*

*Carlos Iglesias: Bye!*

*Hans Overbeek (NL): bye*

*Bert Van Nuffelen 2: bye*

*Susanne Wigard (DIGIT ISA): bye*

*Vassilios Peristeras EC/ISA: Bye*

*Nikos Loutas, PwC: bye, thanks everyone, meeting minutes will follow soon*

*Anastasia Dimou 2: bye*

1. The overview of proposed solutions: <https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/sites/default/files/dcat-ap_resolution_proposals_v0.01.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-1)