DCAT-AP resolution proposals

v0.01, 2015-04-12

1 Discussion items without proposed resolution

1.1 Theme vocabulary

Joinup issues:	VO2
Description:	Publications Office has proposed a new list. Little discussion has taken place, and no clear consensus has been reached yet.
Proposed resolution:	None.
Proposed action:	To be discussed.

2 Discussion items with proposed resolution

2.1 Provenance

Joinup issues:	PR6, PR13, PR14, MO5
Description:	Various proposals to add provenance and lineage information. There is one set of proposals to identify some provenance aspects with the use of specific properties, and one proposal to include some of the PROV ontology to express more formally provenance aspects. The potential properties proposed would identify: • the responsible authority of the Dataset, e.g. dct:creator on Dataset • the lineage of a Dataset, e.g. dct:provenance on Dataset • the Dataset that was used as input, e.g. dct:source on Dataset • the original metadata, e.g. dct:source on CatalogRecord The inclusion of parts of PROV would need a separate discussion.
Proposed resolution:	For the time being, agree on the approach with the four additional properties. Create new work item to consider inclusion of parts of PROV for future work.
Proposed action:	Add dct:provenance and dct:source as optional properties on Dataset. The other two are already in draft 1.

2.2 Distribution details

Joinup issues:	details-distribution, MO1, IM2, IM8
Description:	Current proposal suggests to use dct:conformsTo to link to a schema, and to use dct:description to provide human-readable information, e.g. about an API or SPARQL endpoint
Proposed resolution:	Adopt approach with the two properties.
Proposed action:	Add dct:conformsTo as optional property on Distribution. dct:description is already in DCAT-AP 1.01 as a recommended property on Distribution.

2.3 MediaType and Format

Joinup issues:	PR22, VO3
Description:	The specification of the same controlled vocabulary for both dcat:mediaType and dct:format is confusing. Suggestions made include the use of the Publications Office' MDR File Type NAL which includes all IANA types plus some others, and to re-interpret DCATs written "IANA mediatypes" rather as "following the RFC 2046/RFC 4288 specification" which would include also the x- tree.
Proposed resolution:	Use the MDR File Type NAL for dct:format and also use dcat:mediaType if and only if the filetype has been registered in IANA. This is compliant with the usage note in DCAT.
Proposed action:	Change controlled vocabulary for dcat:mediaType to the types registered by IANA. Keep MDR File types NAL for dct:format.

2.4 Places

Joinup issues:	VO9
Description:	Issue has been raised that not all places necessary are in the MDR Places NAL. DCAT-AP now mandates the use of the Countries NAL and the Places NAL.
Proposed resolution:	Give recommendation for additional vocabulary in case the location is not in the Places NAL, e.g. Geonames
Proposed action:	Add recommendation to use URIs from http://sws.geonames.org/ if place not in Places NAL.

2.5 Frequency vocabulary

Joinup issues:	VO4
Description:	DCAT-AP mandates the use of the DCMI Frequency vocabulary, while DCAT uses a code list from SDMX in an example.
Proposed resolution:	As the DCMI set has more terms than the SDMX list, and changing the vocabulary will require implementations to convert data, there should be no change unless there are compelling arguments to do so.
Proposed action:	None.

3   Fix by adding one or more properties

3.1 VoID integration

Joinup issues:	MO2
Description:	Current proposal is to use foaf:page on Dataset to link to a void:DatasetDescription. However, that link should rather be on the Distribution.
Proposed resolution:	Link to a void:DatasetDescription on the Distribution
Proposed action:	Add foaf:page as optional property on Distribution.

3.2 Indication of public vs. restricted Dataset

Joinup issues:	PR2, PR3
Description:	Current proposal is to use two properties: one to indicate access level (open or restricted) and one to express why the dataset is not open.
Proposed resolution:	Indicate information on whether a dataset is open or restricted using dct:accessRights and an explanation of non-openness using dct:description
Proposed action:	Add dct:accessRights as optional property on Dataset. dct:description is already in DCAT-AP 1.01 as mandatory property on Dataset.

3.3 Whole/part relationships between Datasets

Joinup issues:	PR11, MO12, nesting-part-relationships-catalog-and-dataset
Description:	A need was expressed to link between a 'father' dataset and its children.
Proposed resolution:	Provide hasPart and isPartOf relationships between Datasets.
Proposed action:	Add dct:hasPart and dct:isPartOf as optional properties on Dataset.

3.4 Time series relationships between Datasets

Joinup issues:	PR5, PR16, MO12
Description:	Proposal to link time-series, e.g. statistics for subsequent years together by creating a 'master' dataset and describing the time-based datasets as versions of the master
Proposed resolution:	Provice hasVersion and isVersionOf relationships between Datasets.
Proposed action:	Add dct:hasVesrion and dct:isVersionOf as optional properties on Dataset.

3.5 Unspecific relationships between Datasets

Joinup issues:	PR19
Description:	A possibility was requested to link a Dataset to related resources.
Proposed resolution:	Provide a basic relationship property.
Proposed action:	Add dct:relation as optional property on Dataset.

3.6 Link to documentation

Joinup issues:	PR19, PR26
Description:	A couple of requests asked for the possibility to link to documentation related to a Dataset of Distribution.
Proposed resolution:	Provide the option to link to documentation from both Dataset and Distribution,
Proposed action:	Add foaf:page as optional property on both Dataset and Distribution.

3.7   dct:Language on Distribution

Joinup issues:	dctlanguage-distribution
Description:	Proposal to distinguish language versions of Distributions
Proposed resolution:	Follow recommendation in DCAT to use dct:language on Distribution
Proposed action:	Add dct:language as optional property on Distribution.

3.8   Indicate language of original metadata

Joinup issues:	PR28
Description:	Proposal to express the language of the original metadata on the catalogue record on the derived metadata.
Proposed resolution:	Allow language to be expressed on catalogue records
Proposed action:	Add dct:language as optional property on CatalogRecord.

4   Fixes related to compliance with DCAT

4.1   Update DCAT-AP to use latest vCard specification

Joinup issues:	CO1
Description:	DCAT-AP uses approach that was changed when DCAT became recommendation.
Proposed resolution:	Align with DCAT.
Proposed action:	Already included in draft 1.

4.2   Replace adms:contactPoint with dcat:contactPoint

Joinup issues:	CO3
Description:	DCAT-AP uses approach that was changed when DCAT became recommendation.
Proposed resolution:	Align with DCAT.
Proposed action:	Already included in draft 1.

4.3   Replace adms:version by owl:versionInfo

Joinup issues:	CO4
Description:	DCAT-AP uses property from draft ADMS namespace which was changed when ADMS became a W3C note
Proposed resolution:	Align with ADMS.
Proposed action:	Already included in draft 1.

5   Editorial changes

5.1   Remove the rdfs:Literal box from the UML diagram

Joinup issues:	ED1
Description:	Box is superfluous.
Proposed resolution:	Delete from diagram.
Proposed action:	Publish new diagram.

6   Won't fix

6.1   Type of Dataset

Joinup issues:	PR27
Description:	Current proposals appear to be on a general level. There does not seem to be a consensus on what kinds of types would need to be distinguished and it is not clear what controlled vocabulary could be used.
Proposed resolution:	No change.
Proposed action:	None.

6.2   Open Data Rights Statement (ODRS) Vocabulary

Joinup issues:	VO7
Description:	There is a general request to recommend ODRS. However, it is not clear whether any of the existing portals implement this.
Proposed resolution:	No change.
Proposed action:	None.

6.3   Metadata license

Joinup issues:	how-express-metadata-license
Description:	Request was formulated tentatively but no strong case was made.
Proposed resolution:	No change.
Proposed action:	None.

6.4   Translated text

Joinup issues:	MO6
Description:	Request was made to enable expression of additional attributes on literals to indicate whether a translation was done by a person or a machine, and what the quality of the translation is.
Proposed resolution:	A resolution would require the class rdfs:Literal to be redefined which is not what the requested intended..
Proposed action:	None.

6.5   Nesting of catalogues

Joinup issues:	nesting-part-relationships-catalog-and-dataset
Description:	Question whether there is a need to have part of relationships between catalogues. There has been no discussion or support for this need.
Proposed resolution:	No change.
Proposed action:	None.

6.6   Harvesting history

Joinup issues:	PR15
Description:	Request had two components, one that indicated the need to be able to refer to the origin of the dataset and one that asked for some indication of whether the dataset had already been harvested to avoid duplicates
Proposed resolution:	The dataset origin can be expressed with dct:source as proposed in the resolution of the provenance issue. The harvesting status is out of scope for the DCAT-AP.
Proposed action:	None.

6.7   Size of catalogue

Joinup issues:	PR17
Description:	Proposal was to add a property to Catalog to specify the size of the catalogue. Comments argued that (a) the figure might go out of date quickly and (b) the number can be easily counted.
Proposed resolution:	No change.
Proposed action:	None.

6.8   Validity of dataset

Joinup issues:	PR18
Description:	Proposal was to add a property to Dataset to express its validity. Questions have arises as to what 'validity' means, but no additional information has been received from the submitter.
Proposed resolution:	No change.
Proposed action:	Remove from revision draft 1.

6.9   Distribution identifier

Joinup issues:	PR20
Description:	Proposal was to add a property to Distribution to express its identifier, similar to the identifier of the Dataset in DCAT. No further information was received on how this would be used in practice.
Proposed resolution:	No change.
Proposed action:	None.

6.10 Sample

Joinup issues:	PR21
Description:	Proposal was to add a property to Dataset to link to a sample. In a comment, it was pointed out that data providers link to samples as if they were Distributions, so adding a property is not necessary.
Proposed resolution:	No change.
Proposed action:	Remove from revision draft 1.