



D02.02 Report on the Maintenance of DCAT-AP

DI/07624 - ABC IV Lot 3 SC63



Basic Document Metadata

Property	Value
Name	D02.02 Report on the Maintenance of DCAT-AP
Release date	22/10/2018
Status	Completed
Version	1.00
Author	Adina Dragan
Reviewed by	Fidel Santiago and Susanne Wigard
Approved by	Fidel Santiago and Susanne Wigard
Abstract	This report serves as a part of a series of quarterly status reports related to the maintenance of DCAT-AP, an Application Profile of the W3C Recommendation DCAT. The production of this and subsequent reports is governed by the Change and Release Management Policy for DCAT-AP.

Document History

Version	Date	Description	Action
0.01	03/10/2018	Created first draft	Creation
0.02	12/10/2018	Created second draft	Update
1.00	22/10/2018	Published version 1.0	Publish

Disclaimer:

The views expressed in this report are purely those of the Author(s) and may not, in any circumstances, be interpreted as stating an official position of the European Commission.

The European Commission does not guarantee the accuracy of the information included in this study, nor does it accept any responsibility for any use thereof.

Reference herein to any specific products, specifications, process, or service by trade name, trademark, manufacturer, or otherwise, does not necessarily constitute or imply its endorsement, recommendation, or favouring by the European Commission.

All care has been taken by the author to ensure that s/he has obtained, where necessary, permission to use any parts of manuscripts including illustrations, maps, and graphs, on which intellectual property rights already exist from the titular holder(s) of such rights or from her/his or their legal representative.

Table of Contents

1	INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND	4
2	ISSUES UNDER CONSIDERATION	5
2.1	OVERVIEW	5
2.2	THE CATEGORISATION OF THE ISSUES	5
2.3	ISSUES FOR A BUG-FIX RELEASE	5
2.4	ISSUES THAT INVOLVE MINOR SEMANTIC CHANGES	5
2.5	ISSUES THAT INVOLVE MAJOR SEMANTIC CHANGES	6
2.6	ISSUES THAT WERE CLOSED	14
3	CONCLUSIONS AND NEXT STEPS	18
ANNEX I	INSTRUCTIONS FOR SUBMISSION OF CHANGE REQUESTS.....	19

Table of Tables

NO TABLE OF FIGURES ENTRIES FOUND.

Table of Figures

NO TABLE OF FIGURES ENTRIES FOUND.

1 INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

This document is part of TASK-02 "DCAT-AP" of [ISA](#)¹ Action 2016.07 "Promoting semantic interoperability among EU Member States", commonly known as SEMIC².

This report serves as a part of a series of quarterly status reports related to the maintenance of [DCAT-AP](#)³, an Application Profile of the W3C Recommendation [DCAT](#)⁴ and is governed by the [Change and Release Management Policy for DCAT-AP](#)⁵.

The current report includes an overview of all issues, their status and proposed resolution in section 2 and section 3 presents the conclusions and next steps.

¹ ISA² https://ec.europa.eu/isa2/home_en

² SEMIC <https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/collection/semantic-interoperability-community-semantic>

³ DCAT application profile for data portals in Europe.
<https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/solution/dcat-application-profile-data-portals-europe/about>

⁴ Data Catalog Vocabulary (DCAT). W3C Recommendation 16 January 2014.
<https://www.w3.org/TR/vocab-dcat/>

⁵ Change and Release Management Policy for DCAT-AP.
<https://joinup.ec.europa.eu/node/700269>

2 ISSUES UNDER CONSIDERATION

2.1 Overview⁶

A total of 62 issues were reviewed in the period from 04 July until 01 October 2018 by being analysed and categorised in bug fixes, minor and major semantic changes.

Thirteen issues were closed; one was included in the next minor release for November 2018 containing a bug fix and a minor semantic change. The rest of the 48 issues remained open for discussions in the next major release.

2.2 The categorisation of the issues

The issues are grouped in the next sections into four categories:

1. Issues for bug-fix release in section 2.3
2. Issues that involve minor semantic changes in section 2.4
3. Issues that involve minor semantic changes in section 2.5
4. Issues that were closed in section 2.6

2.3 Issues for a bug-fix release

ID	DCAT-AP-1
Title	Cardinality dct:type on Licence Document
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/1
Discussion	Editorial comment on the DCAT-AP v1.1 published PDF: on page 26 dct:type is a mandatory property for LicenseDocument, but on p 15 it is stated a recommended property. So which one to follow?
Proposed resolution	dct:type is a recommended property for LicenseDocument based on the UML diagram. The documentation will be corrected at page 26 on next minor release in November 2018.

2.4 Issues that involve minor semantic changes

The issue DCAT-AP-1 will be included in November 2018 minor semantic release.

ID	DCAT-AP-1
-----------	------------------

⁶ Change requests for DCAT-AP are handled through an [issue tracker on GitHub](https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/) (<https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/>). This repository had 24 [watchers](https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/watchers) (<https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/watchers>) as of 01 October 2018, two being members of the SEMIC team. Others include representatives from the Publications Office, and national data portals of Norway, Italy, Spain and Germany.

Title	Cardinality dct:type on Licence Document
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/1
Discussion	As some licences may need to be associated with more than one licence type in the ADMS Licence Type Vocabulary, the maximum occurrence of dct:type for dct:LicenseDocument should be raised from 1 to n.
Proposed resolution	In the next minor semantic release of November 2018, cardinality will change to 0..n. ⁷

2.5 Issues that involve major semantic changes

The issues presented below are still open for comments and will be discussed in the DCAT-AP Working Group starting from March 2019, in preparation for the next major release scheduled for November 2019.

ID	DCAT-AP-3
Title	dcat:Catalog - dct:spatial recommended?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/3
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	Make dct:spatial recommended for Catalog.

ID	DCAT-AP-5
Title	dcat:Catalog - remove dct:rights?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/5
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	Remove dct:rights from Catalog.

ID	DCAT-AP-6
Title	dcat:Catalog - remove dct:isPartOf?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/6
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	Remove dct:isPartOf from Catalog

ID	DCAT-AP-9
-----------	------------------

⁷ Retain issue for next major semantic release to discuss other ways of expressing characteristics of licences, for example as discussed in the Dataset Exchange Working Group at W3C. See: <https://github.com/w3c/dxwg/issues/114>.

Title	dcat:Dataset - dct:spatial recommended?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/9
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	Make dct:spatial recommended for Dataset.

ID	DCAT-AP-10
Title	dcat:Dataset - remove adms:sample?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/10
Discussion	One comment that argued that a different property could be designed that would allow an empty table to serve a template for the data.
Proposed resolution	Remove adms:sample from Dataset.

ID	DCAT-AP-11
Title	dcat:Dataset- remove adms:versionNotes?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/11
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	No change.

ID	DCAT-AP-15
Title	dcat:Dataset - remove dct:relation?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/15
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	Remove dct:relation from dcat:Dataset

ID	DCAT-AP-16
Title	dcat:Dataset - remove dct:source?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/16
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	Remove dct:source from dcat:Dataset.

ID	DCAT-AP-17
Title	dcat:Dataset - remove dct:type?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/17

D02.02 Report on the Maintenance of DCAT-AP

Discussion	One comment that the type could be used to group related datasets into collections. One comment that the type can be used to distinguish between datasets, dataset series, geospatial datasets, documents, etc., and may use a controlled vocabulary for this.
Proposed resolution	No change. Note discussion at DXWG, see: https://github.com/w3c/dxwg/issues/64

ID	DCAT-AP-18
Title	dcat:Dataset - remove owl:versionInfo?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/18
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	No change.

ID	DCAT-AP-21
Title	dcat:Distribution - remove dct:rights?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/21
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	Remove dct:rights from Distribution.

ID	DCAT-AP-22
Title	dcat:Distribution - remove dcat:byteSize?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/22
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	Remove dcat:byteSize from Distribution.

ID	DCAT-AP-23
Title	dcat:Distribution - remove dct:language?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/23
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	Remove dct:language from Distribution.

ID	DCAT-AP-24
Title	dcat:Distribution - remove spdx:checksum?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/24
Discussion	None.

D02.02 Report on the Maintenance of DCAT-AP

Proposed resolution	Remove spdx:checksum from Distribution.
---------------------	---

ID	DCAT-AP-28
Title	dcat:Distribution - remove foaf:page?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/28
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	Remove foaf:page from Distribution.

ID	DCAT-AP-29
Title	dcat:CatalogRecord - remove dct:conformsTo?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/29
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	Remove dct:conformsTo from CatalogRecord.

ID	DCAT-AP-30
Title	dcat:CatalogRecord - remove dct:title?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/30
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	Remove dct:title from CatalogRecord.

ID	DCAT-AP-31
Title	dcat:CatalogRecord - remove dct:source?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/31
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	Remove dct:source from CatalogRecord.

ID	DCAT-AP-32
Title	dcat:CatalogRecord - remove dct:language?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/32
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	Remove dct:language from CatalogRecord.

ID	DCAT-AP-33
Title	dcat:CatalogRecord - remove dct:description?

D02.02 Report on the Maintenance of DCAT-AP

URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/33
Discussion	One comment that currently catalogue records are not harvested by the European Data Portal.
Proposed resolution	Remove dct:description from CatalogRecord.

ID	DCAT-AP-34
Title	licenseDocument
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/34
Discussion	Suggestion to specify a mandatory controlled vocabulary for the dct:license property as well as to devise a mechanism to provide addition information with the licence, e.g. the way attribution needs to be done. This issue is further addressed in section Error! Reference source not found.
Proposed resolution	No change. Note discussion at DXWG, see: https://github.com/w3c/dxwg/issues/114

ID	DCAT-AP-35
Title	Support for data integration
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/35 , created from a comment at https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/4
Discussion	Introduces a requirement to support data integration in the case of a combination of data from various sources.
Proposed resolution	Retain issue for next major semantic release, also taking into account the discussions at W3C DXWG, see https://www.w3.org/TR/dcat-ucr/#ID7 and https://www.w3.org/TR/dcat-ucr/#ID26

ID	DCAT-AP-38
Title	DCAT: Distribution – Suggestion attribute for record - 'temporal granularity'
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/38
Discussion	One comment objecting to the proposed range of rdfs:Literal. It was pointed out that a property dcat:granularity was defined during development of DCAT but deprecated before DCAT reached Recommendation status. If decided that DCAT-AP Working Group wants to use this property, need to discuss with DXWG to ask for deprecation. MDR Time period NAL (http://publications.europa.eu/mdr/authority/timeperiod/) could be used as a controlled vocabulary.
Proposed resolution	Retain issue for next major semantic release.

D02.02 Report on the Maintenance of DCAT-AP

ID	DCAT-AP-39
Title	DCAT: Dataset – Suggestion attribute for record - ‘maintainer’
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/39
Discussion	One comment objecting to the proposed range of rdfs:Literal. Further comments that earlier work on DCAT-AP discussed agent roles. Definition of maintainer is very close to semantics for publisher.
Proposed resolution	No change.

ID	DCAT-AP-40
Title	DCAT: Distribution – suggestion attribute for record – ‘planned availability’
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/40
Discussion	Proposed by German data portal. One comment that range should be skos:Concept, not rdfs:Resource.
Proposed resolution	Retain issue for next major semantic release.

ID	DCAT-AP-42
Title	DCAT: Dataset - Suggestion attribute for record – ‘dct:contributor’
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/42
Discussion	One comment that range should not be rdfs:Literal. The obvious candidate would be dct:contributor with range dct:Agent.
Proposed resolution	Retain issue for next major semantic release.

ID	DCAT-AP-44
Title	SPDX Vokabular - the existing SPDX vocabulary features only ONE has algorithm. This is definitely not enough and does not even covers those algorithms used by CKAN
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/44
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	Retain issue for next major semantic release.

ID	DCAT-AP Validator-20
Title	Installation instructions seem to be outdated
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/dcat-ap_validator/issues/20

D02.02 Report on the Maintenance of DCAT-AP

Discussion	After deploying validators pages folder to fuseki, the dcat-ap_validator.html page searches for /css/concat/dcat.css and /js/concat/dcat.js, however, there is no concat folder, only various other subfolders of /css and /js, so it does not work.
Proposed resolution	No change to the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP Validator-10
Title	The validator instance is not working
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/dcat-ap_validator/issues/10
Discussion	The validator instance is not working but it was published at: http://dcat-ap.semic.eu/dcat-ap_validator.html
Proposed resolution	No change to the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP Validator-8
Title	Checks for vcard:Kind are incorrect
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/dcat-ap_validator/issues/8
Discussion	See the VCard specification. vcard:Kind is a superclass, it actually does not specify the kind of the VCard. Therefore, its usage should not be valid. Instead, the usage of the sub-classes should be encouraged (Group, Individual, Location, Organization), which is now treated as invalid.
Proposed resolution	No change to the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP SHACL-35
Title	test suite
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/dcat-ap_shacl/issues/35
Discussion	The issue questioned whether there are plans to develop a test suite and it was answered that it is considered as an open request for adding a test suite for the DCAT-AP.
Proposed resolution	No change to the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP SHACL-29
Title	shex
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/dcat-ap_shacl/issues/29
Discussion	Discussion inquired about the use of ShEx as an option to SHACL
Proposed resolution	No change to the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP SHACL-32
Title	implement recommended and optional constraints
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/dcat-ap_shacl/issues/32
Discussion	Enhancement proposed: :warnings and: info constraints in a separate file [Recommended and optional fields for the future]
Proposed resolution	implementation of Recommended and Optional properties (:warnings and: info) is postponed for the next iteration of this work. No change to the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP SHACL-18
Title	Use of sh:hasValue
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/dcat-ap_shacl/issues/18
Discussion	The way GeoNamesRestriction etc. are modelled with sh:hasValue won't work (AFAIK). It'll just force one of your frequencies to be the node http://publications.europa.eu/resource/authority/frequency
Proposed resolution	No change to the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP SHACL-9
Title	Readability of the RDF/XML file
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/dcat-ap_shacl/issues/9
Discussion	RDF and XML by themselves are nice. But RDF/XML is ugly. Please use Turtle or a similar format.
Proposed resolution	No change to the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP SHACL-4
Title	dcat:mediaType value constraint
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/dcat-ap_shacl/issues/4
Discussion	IANA does not provide a list of URIs for mime type. Is there an alternative to that? There is a list on https://www.iana.org/assignments/media-types/media-types.xhtml , e.g. there is a URI for https://www.iana.org/assignments/media-types/application/rdf+xml , but not all MIME types have such a URI.
Proposed resolution	No change to the specification.

2.6 Issues that were closed

The following issues were closed:

ID	DCAT-AP-2
Title	dcat:Catalog - dcat:themeTaxonomy mandatory?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/2
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	No changes to the specification as it was concluded that is not necessary to enforce a stricter cardinality while usage is already 100%.

ID	DCAT-AP-4
Title	dcat:Catalog - remove dct:language?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/4
Discussion	One comment arguing that the property should be retained. A question was asked what the implications were of removal of properties. This issue is further addressed in section Error! Reference source not found.
Proposed resolution	Issue rejected due to disagreement comments. The issue will be closed with no changes in the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP-8
Title	dcat:Dataset - use of dct:publisher and dcat:contactPoint
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/8
Discussion	Comment from the Working Group that information about the publisher is crucial.
Proposed resolution	Issue rejected due to disagreement comments. The issue will be closed with no changes in the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP-12
Title	dcat:Dataset - remove dct:accessRights?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/12
Discussion	One comment that, even in the case the property was removed from DCAT-AP, the national profile would still keep it.
Proposed resolution	Issue rejected due to disagreement comments. The issue will be closed with no changes in the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP-13
Title	dcat:Dataset - remove dct:hasVersion?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/13
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	The issue will be closed with no changes in the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP-14
Title	dcat:Dataset - remove dct:isVersionOf?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/14
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	The issue will be closed with no changes in the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP-25
Title	dcat:Distribution - remove dct:conformsTo?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/25
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	Issue rejected due to disagreement comments. The issue will be closed with no changes in the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP-45
Title	DCAT: Distribution - Correction of adms:changetype
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/45
Discussion	None
Proposed resolution	The issue was closed as it was related to issue https://github.com/SEMICeu/dcat-ap_shacl/issues/5 that was also closed

ID	DCAT-AP-7
Title	dcat:Dataset - how to encourage the use of dct:description?
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/7
Discussion	Several comments that the provision of a description of the catalogue is an important aspect of quality and should be imposed.
Proposed resolution	The issue will be closed and no changes will be done to the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP-19
Title	dcat:Dataset - harmonise the use of dct:accrualPeriodicity
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/19
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	The issue will be closed and no changes will be done to the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP-20
Title	dcat:Distribution - usage of dct:title and dct:format
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/20
Discussion	None.
Proposed resolution	The issue will be closed and no changes will be done to the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP-26
Title	dcat:Distribution - use of dct:format and dcat:mediaType
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/26
Discussion	One comment that a national profile includes a guideline for the use of these properties.
Proposed resolution	The issue will be closed and no changes will be done to the specification.

ID	DCAT-AP-41
Title	DCAT: Distribution - Suggestion attribute for record – 'LicenseattributionByText'
URL	https://github.com/SEMICeu/DCAT-AP/issues/41
Discussion	Proposal was made to add a new property to provide attribution text for licence. It was pointed out that the possibility already exists to link to an odr:RightsStatement that can include a property odr:attributionText.

D02.02 Report on the Maintenance of DCAT-AP

Proposed resolution	The issue will be closed and no changes will be done to the specification.
---------------------	--

3 CONCLUSIONS AND NEXT STEPS

The activity described in this report resulted in the creation of the next minor semantic release for DCAT-AP which was sent for review to the working group in October 2018. Once the consensus is reached, DCAT-AP version 1.2 will be published to the public in November 2018.

The next activity to be undertaken is the consideration of all of the open issues listed in section 2 in the context of the next major semantic release. The closing date of change requests for the major semantic category is March 2019 when the discussions with the DCAT-AP working Group will be started. November 2019 is the month when the next major release will be published.

Annex I INSTRUCTIONS FOR SUBMISSION OF CHANGE REQUESTS

The following text is available in each of the repositories for the respective vocabularies.

Any problems encountered or suggestions for new functionalities can be submitted as issues on this repository. Submitters of issues need to register for a free user account by clicking "*Sign up for GitHub*" on the GitHub start page.

To submit an issue, click on the "*Issues*" tab when signed in to the <vocabulary> repository and then click on the green "*New issue*" button.

Give the issue a short but meaningful title, for example mentioning the class or property to which the issue is related.

Furthermore, in the body of the issue, please provide as much information as possible, for example:

- submitter name and affiliation
- portal, service or software product represented or affected
- clear and concise description of the problem or requirement
- proposed solution, if any

This information will help the Operational Team to classify the issue as a bug fix, minor semantic issue or major semantic issue.

The Operational Team will respond to the issue within two weeks with an initial reaction and an indication of the next steps to be taken.